



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2012_AJEA_2979
Title of the Manuscript:	HAEMATOLOGY AND SERUM CHARACTERISTICS OF AFRICAN CATFISH (<i>Clarias gariepinus</i> Burchell) FED GRADED LEVELS OF TIGERNUT BASED DIETS

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	How many samples were taken N=?. The means values have not been supported by SD or SEM. The main purpose is to calculate the over all growth. That is commercially important . why emphases has not been given on the growth. Beans , seeds and lentils do have anti-nutritional substances. There easy treatment is also available. Should conduct one of them. How do justify the health status of the fish with the parameters used. Conclusion needs elaboration. Was the diet immediately consumed. If left for a prolonged period of time it could also cause leaching of nutrients.	The data was taken in triplicates. I have indicated the SEM values as directed. See attached MS. <i>Clarias species</i> are mostly benthos hence may not know the actual time of total feed consumption. 2. Feeding processed or treated tigernut meal is a different study exactly. This research evaluates the effect of feeding raw seed on the haematology of the fish.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Do cat fishes actually require change of water during a 20 week trial when they were kept in a pond in net cages?	Yes, changing of water is necessary when transparency exceed 50cm especially for catfish in monoculture unlike Tilapia that feeds on algae ELSE ammonia may build up.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The study is a preliminary work. Needs to incorporate parameters that justify nutritional studies.	